

## Judgments and decisions of 25 July 2024

The European Court of Human Rights has today notified in writing five judgments<sup>1</sup> and two decisions<sup>2</sup>:

two Chamber judgments are summarised below;

three separate press releases have been issued for the Chamber judgments in the cases of *M.A. and Others v. France* (application no. 63664/19), *Zdanoka v. Latvia* (no. 42221/18), and *Couso Permy v. Spain* (no. 2327/20);

a separate press release has been issued for the decision in the case of *Levrault v. Monaco* (no. 47070/20).

The one remaining decision can be consulted on [Hudoc](#) and does not appear in this press release.

*The judgments summarised below are available only in English.*

### [D.H. and Others v. Sweden](#) (application no. 34210/19)

The applicants are a family of Eritrean nationals. The first applicant, A.G., was born in 1984 and lives in Vallentuna, Sweden, having been granted asylum there in December 2015. Her two children, born in 2009 and 2011, and her mother, born in 1956, live in Sudan.

The first applicant complains about the refusal to grant her family reunification with her two children and her mother, on the ground that she, at the time of the application, failed to fulfil the “maintenance requirement” (minimum-income and accommodation requirement).

Relying on Articles 8 (right to respect for private and family life) and 14 (prohibition of discrimination) of the European Convention on Human Rights the applicants complain that the Swedish authorities’ refusal to grant them family reunification violated their right to respect for family life and that that decision amounted to indirect discrimination.

### **No violation of Article 8**

### [Okubamichael Debru v. Sweden](#) (no. 49755/18)

The applicant, Mr Berhane Okubamichael Debru, is an Ethiopian national who was born in 1954 and lives in Vasteras, Sweden, after moving to Sweden in September 2017, having been granted a permanent residence permit as a recognised refugee. The applicant’s wife and two daughters, then applied from Uganda, where the family had been living before his departure, for Swedish residence permits on the basis of their family ties.

<sup>1</sup> Under Articles 43 and 44 of the Convention, Chamber judgments are not final. During the three-month period following a Chamber judgment’s delivery, any party may request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber of the Court. If such a request is made, a panel of five judges considers whether the case deserves further examination. In that event, the Grand Chamber will hear the case and deliver a final judgment. If the referral request is refused, the Chamber judgment will become final on that day. Under Article 28 of the Convention, judgments delivered by a Committee are final.

Once a judgment becomes final, it is transmitted to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe for supervision of its execution. Further information about the execution process can be found here: [www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/execution](http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/execution)

<sup>2</sup> Inadmissibility and strike-out decisions are final.

Family reunification was refused on the ground that he, at the time of the application, failed to fulfil the “maintenance requirement” (minimum-income and accommodation requirement).

Relying on Articles 8 (right to respect for private and family life) and 14 (prohibition of discrimination), the applicant complains that the refusal to grant his wife and children residence permits violated his right to respect for his family life. He also complains that, in the light of his age and state of health, the decision to refuse family reunification amounted to discrimination.

### **No violation of Article 8**

---

This press release is a document produced by the Registry. It does not bind the Court. Decisions, judgments and further information about the Court can be found on [www.echr.coe.int](http://www.echr.coe.int). To receive the Court’s press releases, please subscribe here: [www.echr.coe.int/RSS/en](http://www.echr.coe.int/RSS/en) or follow us on Twitter [@ECHR\\_CEDH](https://twitter.com/ECHR_CEDH).

#### **Press contacts**

[echrpres@echr.coe.int](mailto:echrpres@echr.coe.int) | tel.: +33 3 90 21 42 08

**We are happy to receive journalists’ enquiries via either email or telephone.**

Tracey Turner-Tretz (tel: + 33 3 88 41 35 30)

Denis Lambert (tel: + 33 3 90 21 41 09)

Inci Ertekin (tel: + 33 3 90 21 55 30)

Neil Connolly (tel: + 33 3 90 21 48 05)

Jane Swift (tel: + 33 3 88 41 29 04)

**The European Court of Human Rights** was set up in Strasbourg by the Council of Europe member States in 1959 to deal with alleged violations of the 1950 European Convention on Human Rights.